

Prince Edward Island would rather be out of Confederation than consent to this motion; we would have no status, only five members.

We were entitled under the Confederation pact to five members.

Only five members out of 194 would give the Island no position.

Then, in the name of Heaven, I ask you gentlemen on both sides of the House, after forty years of Confederation what would three members give us as compared with 234.

Hon. Mr. CLORAN—Hear, hear.

Hon. Mr. MURPHY—Mr. Palmer said:

Representation by population is not applicable when a certain number of provinces are throwing up their self-government and individuality. When a colony surrenders that right she would have something commensurate in the Confederation. Why give up so great certainties where we have only a feeble voice?

The great certainties of the right to make our own laws, to stand out of the Confederation and not suffer—if you want me to say so on the floor of this House—that we did suffer under Confederation, for we were more penalized than any other province under Confederation. In this connection I want to draw your attention to the fact that even under the present system of representation by population the representation of the rural constituencies is based on a smaller unit than the representation of urban constituencies. While the general unit of representation for Canada is about 32,000, the unit for rural constituencies is not more than 18,000 or 20,000. I want to draw your attention to the fact that the population of Prince Edward Island is practically rural. Our biggest city—it would be called a town in any other province—has only 12,000 people. The next largest, the county town of the county from which I come is only 3,000 and the next one to that has a population of only 1,000. So practically for the purpose of representation, our population is rural as compared with the population of Ontario and Quebec, and even Nova Scotia and New Brunswick in a lesser degree, and as compared to what we expect the West to be in years to come when large cities like Winnipeg, Vancouver, Calgary and Edmonton will grow up like mushrooms. Taking the 93,000 in Prince Edward Island as rural population, on a unit of 18,000 we should have five members. Colonel Grey speaking of this question at the Quebec conference said:

Hon. Mr. MURPHY.

Colonel Grey:

I am instructed by my co-delegate to say that the provision of five members is unsatisfactory.

They did not want to join the union for the reason that commensurate representation would not be given them, and their voice in the Confederation would be too feeble. In a subsequent session of the Prince Edward Island legislature, in the winter of 1865, we find the following statement made by—

Hon. Mr. POWER—I really do not see what relevance this has to the address which we are trying to concur in.

Hon. Mr. MURPHY—I am very sorry if the hon. gentleman cannot see the relevance of it. In my opinion it is very pointed. The hon. leader of the Opposition in this House attacked the last clause, the effect of which is to redress the wrong that has been done to Prince Edward Island. I was going to move myself a motion to the effect that that clause should be amended to increase the number of our representatives to the original representation fixed at Confederation. We were deprived of our proper representation by a clerical error in writing the terms, and this is the best compromise that could be made by both sides of politics to redress that grievance, and give the half measure of justice. I felt like moving to restore the original representation, but recognizing the desire of the Government to do justice to Prince Edward Island, I intended to let the motion pass without any attempt to amend it. I do not think any wise purpose could be served, even if I were ruled out of order, by taking exception to my trying to place before the fair-minded men of this Chamber the claims of the province that I represent. I want to show that the resolution in this address is only doing partial justice, long delayed—that it is only a part of what we expected we would receive when we entered Confederation. Now here are the words of the Premier of Prince Edward Island, the Hon. J. C. Pope, who was afterwards Minister of Marine and Fisheries in the Government of Sir John Macdonald:—

If the relative circumstances of Canada and this island rendered a Union practicable, the evident injustice of the terms agreed to by the Quebec conference would prevent their being ratified by the legislature of this island. Without admitting the principle of representation according to population under all circumstances to be sound, it is, in the opinion of this House, particularly objectionable as applied to this island in connection with Canada, taking into