

the arguments of which the honourable Member for Lotbinière has just advised us.

Just the same, as far as I am concerned, I must keep not to the gist of the honourable Member's proposal but to his view on procedure. And in my opinion, the honourable Member's proposal would establish a universal monthly payment to every person who has attained the age of sixty years. If my memory serves me right, such universal payment would amount to \$150.

Citation 246(3) of Beauchesne's Parliamentary Rules and Forms, fourth edition, reads as follows: (3) The guiding principle in determining the effect of an amendment upon the financial initiative of the Crown is that the communication, to which the royal demand of recommendation is attached, must be treated as laying down *once for all* (unless withdrawn and replaced) not only the amount of a charge, but also its objects, purposes, conditions and qualifications.

In other words, it must be recognized that the royal recommendation establishes the terms and conditions of the financial liabilities which may be proposed to the House, and in this sense the motion of the honourable Member for Portneuf is not in order.

I should like now to deal with the motion which stands in the name of the honourable Member for Simcoe North (Mr. Rynard). Despite the very brilliant argument submitted by the honourable Member for Peace River (Mr. Baldwin) I find it difficult to ignore the long standing doctrine relating to the financial initiative of the Crown. The honourable Member was arguing in the House just the other day that a certain bill would require the Royal Consent. I think if this House were at any time desirous of changing the doctrine of the financial initiative of the Crown, the Royal Consent might very well be necessary on that one point. If the honourable Member presented the argument that I should have to consider very seriously whether this proposal would not effectively affect one of the prerogatives of the Crown, perhaps I might need

to go into the matter more deeply. Yet perhaps that is not necessary.

There are a few more points of view which I was tempted to go into; I suggest to honourable Members that that is not necessary. I have expressed the basis on which I have to make the suggestion to honourable Members that the motion should not be put.

Before the first motion standing in the name of the honourable Member for Winnipeg North Centre (Mr. Knowles) is put by the Chair, I should like to suggest that motions numbered 1 and 3 might be considered and voted upon as one proposition.

Mr. Knowles (Winnipeg North Centre), seconded by Mr. Rynard, moved,—That Bill C-202, An Act to amend the Old Age Security Act, be amended by deleting from Clause 1 lines 4 to 11 at page 1.

Mr. Knowles (Winnipeg North Centre), seconded by Mr. Rynard, moved,—That Bill C-202, An Act to amend the Old Age Security Act, be amended by deleting Clause 2 therefrom.

And debate arising thereon;

By unanimous consent, the hour for Private Members' Business was suspended.

Debate was resumed on the motion of Mr. Knowles (Winnipeg North Centre), seconded by Mr. Rynard,—That Bill C-202, An Act to amend the Old Age Security Act, be amended by deleting from Clause 1 lines 4 to 11 at page 1.

And on the motion of Mr. Knowles (Winnipeg North Centre), seconded by Mr. Rynard,—That Bill C-202, An Act to amend the Old Age Security Act, be amended by deleting Clause 2 therefrom.

After further debate, the question being put on the said motions, they were negatived on the following division:

YEAS
Messrs.

| | | | | |
|-------------------|-------------------|------------------|--------------|--------------|
| Alexander, | Flemming, | Lambert | McKinley, | Ryan, |
| Alkenbrack, | Fortin, | (Bellechasse), | Marshall, | Rynard, |
| Baldwin, | Gauthier, | Lambert | Mather, | Saltsman, |
| Beaudoin, | Gilbert, | (Edmonton West), | Mazankowski, | Scott, |
| Bell, | Gleave, | Laprise, | Monteith, | Skoberg, |
| Benjamin, | Godin, | La Salle, | Muir, | Southam, |
| Bigg, | Grills, | Latulippe, | Murta, | Stanfield, |
| Broadbent, | Gundlock, | Lewis, | Nesbitt, | Stewart |
| Burton, | Hales, | Lundrigan, | Nystrom, | (Marquette), |
| Cadieu, | Harding, | MacEwan, | Orlikow, | Thomas |
| Coates, | Horner, | MacInnis (Cape | Paproski, | (Moncton), |
| Comeau, | Howard (Skeena), | Breton-East | Peddle, | Thompson |
| Crouse, | Howe, | Richmond), | Peters, | (Red Deer), |
| Dinsdale, | Knowles (Winnipeg | MacInnis (Mrs.), | Ricard, | Thomson |
| Dionne, | North Centre), | MacLean, | Ritchie, | (Battleford- |
| Douglas (Nanaimo- | Knowles (Norfolk- | Macquarrie, | Rodrigue, | Kindersley), |
| Cowichan-The | Haldimand), | McCleave, | Rondeau, | Yewchuk—79. |
| Islands), | Korchinski, | McCutcheon, | Rose, | |
| Fairweather, | | McGrath, | Rowland, | |