

works in the Medicine Hat confirm the original statement and newspaper advertisement. I should be very glad to see the figures given, the same as in the Hat News to which you will be much appreciated by,

Times sent the following

own Block, Winnipeg.

letter of 5th June, forwarded possible to say whether we canneries which is hidden. I have not seen the Hat News to which you with facts and figures there

as a chartered accountant, bear an impress of truth. I have been considerably revised for a modest profit of 250 at the real importance of the of Mr. Malcolm.

out forth, and the arrangements to indicate, have been interest are such as would at the enterprise is in good they do not satisfy me. It account of what has become and to have an independent who has been in the pack has made a success of it.

Editorial Comment.
canneries in the West is one at Edmonton by Mr. But a cannery with Mr. and friend—! That is which are eloquent indeed.

as typed, I have seen the of the editorial comment, t, there is a write-up, the guess the identity of the chartered accountant should being in any way an assurance of methods. You must use of humour."

included in Mr. Forster's News, is alleged to have s, and is the investigation to above, which this paper

ed and Never Received.

Winnipeg, June 29, 1907.

ceipt of your letter of the my thanks, and in reply replying thereto until now investigations on the lines of results.

the board of directors hold the operations of the consisting of Messrs. B. invested by the Board with Mr. Malcolm has no in- ption as one director out

the company are deposited Bank, and that the assigned by four signatures. two of the directors and tant of this city, who is charge of the company's

ified by documentary and mined several books of the cheques, etc.

that you have been wrongly far as their accounts are od, but they are in first-

after very full inquiries, anything detrimental to his

reputation. He appears to have come to Winnipeg some eight years ago from South Africa, at the outbreak of the war there, and was shortly after appointed secretary of the Central Canada Chamber of Mines (a semi-governmental statistical bureau) with a very influential membership.

"Before, however, that appointment was made a committee appointed Mr. Heubach, of the Winnipeg Industrial Exhibition, to investigate his record in Africa, which proved to be very satisfactory, and I have failed to hear anything against him since his arrival in Canada (excepting perhaps that not being a man of means his success in this matter may be viewed by the small financial group with a certain amount of envy), so that if you know of anything I should be under obligation if you would kindly furnish me with particulars, as it is to the public interest that it should be known to the shareholders, who have invested something like three hundred thousand dollars in the enterprise.

"I have also ascertained that when the company commences packing operations Mr. Malcolm is to receive as salary \$2,500 per annum and ten per cent. of the profits after fifty per cent. dividends have been paid to shareholders; in the meantime his remuneration is one hundred dollars per month, and a commission in common with other brokers of five per cent. upon what shares he actually disposes of personally.

Chartered Accountant Gets Another Surprise.

"I have also looked through the guard books, containing the original signed applications for shares in the company, and am myself surprised at the company's strength. The personnel of the shareholders is such that the company is without question one of the strongest yet organized in Western Canada.

"Work also appears to be proceeding rapidly in building operations at Medicine Hat, and, taking an impartial view of the company from all points, I feel convinced that you have formed an entirely erroneous opinion of this company.

"This is also the general view here, for the company is unquestionably looked upon, both in Winnipeg and throughout the West, as a legitimate and promising undertaking.

"Yours truly, (Signed) A. P. Davenport, chartered accountant, Winnipeg."

We would now ask Mr. Davenport why, having received a letter from the Toronto office of the Monetary Times, his second letter, alleged to have been sent to the Monetary Times, should be forwarded to the Montreal office? And why, if Mr. Davenport's second communication miscarried in the mail, he did not write us asking for an acknowledgment?

Mr. Malcolm and the Chamber of Mines.

What is the sum total of Mr. Davenport's report? The control of the much vaunted Western Canneries is in the hands of three men, Messrs. Banfield, Gilmour and Richardson. Certain statements, which Mr. Davenport affirms are facts, he says he has verified by documentary and oral evidence. Mr. Davenport's satisfaction does not represent the satisfaction of the prospective investor.

With regard to Mr. Malcolm, "he appears to have come to Winnipeg from South Africa, and was appointed secretary of the Central Canada Chamber of Mines, a semi-governmental statistical bureau." Semi-governmental is a happy adjective. Its charm lies in its vagueness. The Central Canada Chamber of Mines, which had no relation whatever to any Government department, and of which Mr. Malcolm was secretary, was the butt of some adverse criticism six years ago. In the issue of the Monetary Times of June 29th, 1900, the following notes appeared:—

"The Winnipeg Chamber of Mines, or to be exact, the Central Canada Chamber of Mines, has been attacked in a cablegram received in London by Reuter's Agency and emanating from Ottawa, so it is said. And on the strength of this the Pall Mall Gazette and other journals are alleged in a Globe special of 21st June to have indulged in adverse criticism.

Not a Tittle of Evidence.

"The Chamber sends out press extracts extolling the field exploited by the Chamber as the greatest in the world, but not giving one tittle of evidence in support of the assertion. It may be worth the while of the Chamber to bear in mind that English people do not like the inflated style of writing that characterizes most of the Chamber's literature that we have seen. Canadians, especially Western Canadians, are used to large adjectives, and believe that their country deserves them. But it is well to observe moderation in communications to Old Country people."

Again in the Monetary Times of October 5th, 1900, the following appeared:—

"The Central Canada Chamber of Mines has been compelled to bear a succession of unfavorable criticisms of its methods of presenting the claims of Central Canada to the

attention of mining investors in the London market. It may be hoped that the criticism has done good, and that we shall have no more 'spread-eagle' bulletins of the probably rich prospects of that promising region.

"The Chamber has now taken to issuing tables of returns of mill crushings, giving particulars of the reef or the shaft, the mine, and the district whence obtained; also kind of ore, where milled, value of ore treated, etc. Also the result of assay tests and the name of the assayer. But more than this must be done, in the opinion of the British Columbia Review, of London, England, which thus expresses itself on the subject of the Chamber's past and present efforts: 'The endeavor to make up for the past deficiencies is laudable and deserving of every encouragement, but, to make their future bulletins of value, it will be necessary to do more than collect a batch of assay certificates and have them endorsed by affidavits. Business men do not attach much importance to the fact that a hole has been dug to a depth of, say, 50 feet, and that portions of rock extracted from that hole have variously assayed from 2 dwts. to 100 ounces.

Question of Reputable Experts.

"Let them see in maps, compiled by experts of repute, that ore veins have been found or traced for certain defined distances, plainly set forth, that they have been exposed at such a depth, and that the certified assays of bulk samples taken right across the vein are so much. If on this particular formation there are any gold producing properties give sworn statements of the cost of mining, milling, transportation of supplies and machinery, the labor conditions, etc., etc.; on such data an intelligent opinion can be formed as to the advisability of investing money in the district. We fully recognize that to prepare such maps and statistics entails expenditure of both time and money, but unless some such plan is methodically carried out, the executive committee of the Central Canada Chamber of Mines will find their efforts fruitless.

"To educate and interest British investors in regard to Canada's great undeveloped mineral resources is not a task to be undertaken lightly, as no doubt the Chamber will discover. We became aware of this by the time our first half-yearly volume was bound. This (London) is the great market of the world, but, however, loudly you shout the value of your wares, no attention is given unless the invoices are drawn up in the accustomed manner, and the goods will bear the most searching scrutiny by the experts of a nation of shopkeepers."

So we see that when Mr. Malcolm was guiding the destiny of the Central Canada Chamber of Mines, there was then a call for information by experts of repute; there was a demand for data upon which intelligent opinion might be formed as to the advisability of investing money; and there was a hint that invoices should be drawn up in the accustomed manner. History repeats itself. Mr. Forster, in his famous defence dispatch, says that he is personally satisfied as to the bona fides of the company. He also has seen the books.

Gentlemen With Big Imaginations.

But how much reliance can be placed on the statements of men, one of whom at least, has invented a story to the effect that the Monetary Times asked for an investigation, and whose imagination gives other erratic examples of how to economize the truth.

Some friend has been kind enough in the past to send us copies of the Medicine Hat News whenever reference to the Western Canneries has appeared therein. The issue which contained Mr. Forster's letter and a head line, "Report of a Chartered Accountant to the Monetary Times" was not sent us. This was a curious oversight on the part of our unknown benefactor.

From Mr. Forster's dispatch, the length of which is only exceeded by its original eloquence, we cull the following interesting extracts:—

"We cannot build up a city upon a platform, the chief planks of which are self-interest, knocking, to Halifax with the other fellow, so long as I am getting all I want. We will have to broaden out and work together and it will come out all right. It is not the dollars we are circulating from one to another—that is going to make us a big city, but it is the dollars we can interest outsiders to come in and invest in Medicine Hat which will help us to make good."

Where Are the Figures?

Mr. Forster bids fair to rival Mr. Malcolm, of Malcolm's Western Canneries, in his extreme optimism. "Go on; pay out your money. I've seen the books. You do not want to see them. Everything will come out alright." That is the essence of Director Forster's philosophy. "It is inconceivable," says this optimistic director, "that anyone without the figures before him should lay himself out to knock an industry." Mr. Forster has missed the point. The Monetary