

It is remarkable that the American Golden Russet and the Duchess of Oldenburg receive the largest number of votes. In every case, except one, these two varieties have been selected.

Mr. A. McD. ALLAN (Toronto).—I think a report of this description requires a great deal of consideration before it should be accepted by the Association. I fancy that a great many people who have sent in lists have omitted to consider many important points, such as, for instance, the commercial value of the varieties recommended. This list is likely to be accepted by the public as receiving the sanction of this Association, and I think that it should be looked into very carefully before we allow it to go out as anything more than a trial list, to elicit for further information. So much depends on soil and cultivation, as also on all the surrounding circumstances, that it is a most difficult thing to specify certain varieties as in all cases the best for certain sections. It is quite certain that the Duchess of Oldenburg is much favored, and if I were selecting a single variety for summer use I would select it; if I were selecting two, I would add the Yellow Transparent. Some very well known varieties are left out of this list altogether. For instance, the Pewaukee is coming into use, but no committee would, I think, recommend it as worthy of cultivation in every season. It is an early winter apple. The Russet, referred to in the report as the American Golden Russet, is not really the Golden Russet at all. The Golden Russet there referred to is the Golden Russet of Western New York, or the English Golden Russet; they are, practically, the same apple; and this is the apple which we have in general cultivation throughout the Province under the name of the American Golden Russet.

Mr. DEMPSEY.—I fully endorse the remarks made by Mr. Allan. The parties making up the lists, in many cases, simply put down the names of the varieties cultivated by themselves. The King of Tompkins County heads our list just because some people have a few apples from it; yet, as a rule, with us, the tree dies before it has reached its bearing time. Now, my list, which I am willing to stand or fall by, is as follows: The most profitable summer apple we are cultivating is the Duchess of Oldenburg. I would succeed that with the Trenton. Then I would name Hubbardston's Nonsuch, then the Blenheim Orange Pippin, and then the Ontario. For a profitable winter apple I would name the Ben Davis; there is more money in it than in all the rest put together. I have said that before, and every year's experience confirms it.

A MEMBER.—Does it spot with you?

Mr. DEMPSEY.—Yes, but it has the faculty of throwing its color over the spot so that you do not see it.

Mr. ALLAN.—There are too many varieties mentioned in the list—too much choice; and it is made up very largely from the opinions of growers whose experience is confined to a very few varieties. I believe that a list of this description, to be of value, should be advisory, and as such should be sent out by the Association. Such a list should be made up upon a thorough examination of the conditions and capabilities of each district. We know that in many cases there are varieties which could be profitably substituted for those now grown, and I think growers should be advised to discard varieties that are not profitable. We should specially have in mind those varieties which will best command the foreign markets, and the point that we are growing apples for profit and not for fun should be kept in view at all times.

Mr. BEALL.—Mr. Allan may have forgotten that the intention of the committee and the Association is that this list should be revised from year to year. The Pewaukee is a variety which should certainly be in the list for a great many districts, as should also be the Ontario, which is one of the most profitable apples we can grow. In the meantime, however, I do not see any objection to the Association accepting this report and publishing it, not as adopted, but as standing for further consideration.

The SECRETARY.—While I agree with Mr. Beall that it is well for us to have a list to work upon, yet this list should certainly be amended considerably before it is printed at all. For instance the Early Harvest is recommended as a summer apple for many districts of Ontario, although very few of us would recommend anyone to plant it for

profit. I name the v

Mr. W successfully or twelve m of the differ districts the formed from If I were m list somewh cessful thro to use his o

Mr. A No. 10 secti season after of Oldenbu Russett of

Mr. G. that certain altogether in a copy of th report again

Mr. D Edward Co Pippin and

Mr. A present a pr able apple, v we not destr very poor op apple it has eating apple

Mr. D quality, but is not fit t is a popular

After s report back they put it i

The SE In these the advisabi country as l

The ide success in th "Is there n ing a vital c in to me, as and of cours

The obj advance the plishing the