

Mr. MACKENZIE KING: —so that we may see the parallel clearly? Was Sir John A. Macdonald's advice refused or declined by the governor general to whom he tendered it?

Mr. MANION: I will deal with that in a moment, and I think rather effectively, by giving citations from the same books from which the right hon. gentleman quoted himself. The leader of the opposition stopped quoting one instance at the very passage which was of interest to this House. I happened to notice that my right hon. friend stopped at a particular point in his quotation from Keith; and I am going to give him not one but sixteen instances in the last few years where governors general have refused dissolution to outgoing governments.

Mr. MACKENZIE KING: My hon. friend cannot give one instance of that kind in Great Britain in one hundred years, or in self-governing dominions.

Mr. MANION: I will give sixteen.

Mr. MACKENZIE KING: Not in the self-governing dominions but in some of the colonies.

Mr. WOODSWORTH: Before the hon. gentleman passes from this point may I ask if he suggests there are sometimes occasions when it would be patriotic to resort to unconstitutional action?

Mr. MANION: My hon. friend has a perfect right to get up and express his opinion but the question is not one entitling any hon. gentleman to rise to a point of order.

Mr. WOODSWORTH: I rose for the purpose—

Some hon. MEMBERS: Order.

Mr. SPEAKER: Order. May I remind hon. gentlemen that the question before the House is one of privilege affecting the independence of members of parliament.

Mr. MANION: I have no objection to anybody asking a question, but I do not think that remarks which have no bearing on the subject are appropriate. Here is an account of what happened in the House of Commons on November 5, 1873. I am going to read just a couple of passages; the report is too lengthy to read the whole of it:

At any rate—

This is Sir John Macdonald speaking—  
—he thought the House would leave that matter—

This was the matter that was being discussed previously—

—in abeyance for a few moments till he made an announcement he had to make. He had to announce that the ministry had resigned.

That was the Macdonald ministry.

Till last night they believed they had the support of this House; that the House would not only give them a vote of confidence, but sufficient support to enable them to carry on satisfactorily the affairs of the government. However, from certain things stated in this House, and from certain communications more or less formal outside of the House, they had reason to believe—in fact they knew—that they had not at this moment a good working majority. The consequence was that he felt it his duty to-day to go to His Excellency and respectfully tender him the resignation of the government, and His Excellency's authority.

Mr. MACKENZIE KING: Hear, hear.

Mr. MANION:

He had it in charge from His Excellency to state that he had accepted the resignation of the administration, and sent for Mr. Mackenzie, the leader of the opposition, to form a government.

And then further down:

Sir John Macdonald observed that it was the bounden duty of the expiring administration to see that the incoming administration had no embarrassments.

But the right hon. gentleman who is leading the opposition here made it his bounden duty to cause every embarrassment not only to the present administration but to the country in general. The right hon. gentleman does not seem to care whether this is a temporary administration—because we admit that it is a temporary administration—he does not seem to care whether the estimates go through, whether Supply is passed, and he does not seem to care whether the legislation which my hon. friends at the other end of the chamber have been fighting for all the session is held up in mid-air or allowed to pass—he does not care anything about it, all he cares is to embarrass the temporary government which was formed within twenty-four hours instead of the period of from six to eight weeks which is usually allotted in such cases.

Mr. DENIS (Joliette): What has my hon. friend been quoting from?

Mr. MANION: From a press report of the debates of that time.

Mr. DENIS (Joliette): A press report?

Mr. MANION: Yes, a press report of the proceedings of the House; I do not think Hansard was in existence at that time, or that there was any official report such as the one now published daily.

Mr. DENIS (Joliette): I am not disputing my hon. friend's statement.