

I admit that this report is not much to prove anything on, but I am taking the report. Now, the report says that the shops were too large. Mr. Lynch-Staunton's argument all the way through is that these shops were being built illegally. That is his argument as to the law. As a final kick he charged that, having been beaten on the law, they are too big anyway. In this connection I want to point out—and I am glad that my hon. friend has given me this opportunity—I might not have thought of it possibly—that this commission had a report before them which is an answer even to the charge that the shops are too large, but they suppressed that report and did not use it. Here is return No. 51 in reply to an Order of the House of Commons dated the 23rd of February, 1914, calling for a copy of the report of George S. Hodgins, New York, regarding the Transcona shops of the Transcontinental railway dated June 10, 1912. This was an expert on shops brought from New York city to give an opinion on the Transcona shops and I want to read some of the statements in his report because from beginning to end this commission have not said one favourable word about the Transcontinental railway or about the shops or anything else. They had this report in the office of the Transcontinental Railway Commission after June 10, 1912. Let me read just a little to satisfy my hon. friend as to the quality of these shops and a few other things. This is the report:—

Report by Mr. George S. Hodgins, Consulting Mechanical Engineer (late of New York), on the National Transcontinental Railway Transcona shops, under instructions from Mr. R. W. Leonard, Chairman of the National Transcontinental railway.

Ottawa, June 10, 1912.

Transcona Shops.

One of the most elementary comparisons of locomotive repair shops is the consideration of the floor area of the erecting and machine shops and the number of pits in the former. The Canadian Pacific railway shops at Winnipeg have practically 32 locomotive pits in a shop approximately 784 feet long by 162 feet wide. This gives a floor area of about 127,000 square feet. The National Transcontinental railway shops at Transcona have practically 24 pits in a shop 612 feet long by 170 feet wide. This gives a floor space of 104,000 square feet. The Canadian Pacific railway shops have, therefore, when the area of the pits is deducted, about 21,000 square feet more floor space than the Transcona shops.

A rough idea of the use made of the floor space may be obtained if the proportion of floor area to pits be considered. The floor space is where the machines and appliances are placed, and is where most of the repair work is done, and where material is placed while work is in progress. It also represents approximately the provision for future needs. The floor area per pit in the Canadian Pacific railway shops is about 3,800 square feet, while that of the National Transcontinental railway shops is 4,000 square feet, so that the difference is something over 200 square feet per pit in favour of Transcona.

While these figures do not pretend to be more than approximations, yet they indicate roughly the state of the case. As a general rule public works, or works of this character are hardly ever designed with much idea of future needs. As an example, the New York subway has increased its train service about 23 per cent in eight years, and this has entailed the extra expense of lengthening the stations with the road in operation. The Canadian Pacific railway shops at Winnipeg are about seven years old and they are now so crowded that the company is preparing to build auxiliary shops at Calgary, Alberta.

Even now, signs of crowding are visible at the Angus shops at Montreal. The Transcona shops may seem to be large for the present requirements, but provision has been made for the legitimate and anticipated growth of traffic on the road. If these shops do not require any great extension for some time to come,