

cumstances, it might be found very useful to have a discretionary power to appoint ministers of different denominations, and divide the money among them in proportion to the duties they perform. I believe this is the practice which has prevailed in Dorchester penitentiary, and I have not heard of any complaint against it. It has worked very well and very satisfactorily all round. I agree with what has been said by some hon. gentlemen, that with regard to a great majority of the prisoners there is not any necessity of making very fine distinctions as to the theology of the clergymen who administer to them while they are in confinement; but circumstances may arise when it may be desirable, and it would be for the benefit of certain prisoners that they should have the services of a clergyman of some particular denomination. I think the suggestion that the minister should have this discretionary power when he thinks proper to exercise it, is a wise one, and I should be glad to see it adopted.

Hon. Mr. SCOTT—I should like to call the attention of the leader of the opposition to interpretation clause (b):

The expression officer means and includes any officer or employee of any of the classes mentioned in the schedule to this Act, or any servant in the employ of the penitentiary.

In the schedule to the Bill the clergymen are named.

Hon. Mr. LOUGHEED—That is only by implication.

Hon. Mr. SCOTT—No, nothing could be clearer.

Hon. Mr. LOUGHEED—Then why should wardens and deputy wardens be mentioned?

Hon. Mr. SCOTT—I have explained already that the Governor in Council have the appointment of warden and deputy warden, and the Minister of Justice has the appointment of all others.

Hon. Mr. FERGUSON—I agree with the remarks of the hon. senator from Westmoreland, and think that the amendment suggested by the minister, would meet the case very fairly. On close examination it will be found that clause 27, taken in connection with the interpretation clause and the schedule, would give power to appoint

these two chaplains and other officers. But if we were to adopt this clause as proposed to be amended, by the hon. Secretary of State, it would simply modify the matter as far as the appointment of a Protestant chaplain is concerned, and enable the minister to apportion the work of the chaplain among the resident clergymen of the different Protestant denominations. I understand that this principle has already been applied, although the old law scarcely admits of it, but it was found to be in itself so fair and reasonable that it has been applied in the Dorchester penitentiary even without a provision such as we are now proposing in the law. Having been found that it was necessary there that is a fair and reasonable way to admit that principle, we should make the law so that the principle may be legally applied there and elsewhere. It also gives rise to another advantage which I have already presented to the House; with regard to the Roman Catholic chaplain there would usually be at the site of the penitentiary only one priest, but when you have to select a chaplain from each of the Protestant denominations it would be found, from the way political pressure is brought to bear on the minister, that he would be scarcely able to resist the influence brought to bear upon him to appoint a clergyman in sympathy with the government of the day. It would remove that pressure altogether if the minister were allowed to apportion the work and distribute the allowance among the ministers of the different denominations.

Hon. Mr. SULLIVAN—Suppose a number of the convicts were to claim that they were Methodists to-day, and to-morrow claim to be Baptists, and then some other day Presbyterians, the odium theologicum would be introduced. I say strike it out altogether. If you knew these gentlemen that you are legislating for, you would find them the greatest blackguards and scoundrels imaginable, and it is not for them to indicate what denomination they belong to. It is for you to say under what code of morality they can best be attended to. It all depends on the man; it does not matter whether he is a Salvation Army officer, a Catholic priest or a Protestant minister, it is the individual himself that influences the convict. Therefore this patched up, mean, miserable con-