

It is that property of the noun which depends upon its relation to other words.—Chandler, p. 14.

It is that modification of nouns and pronouns indicated by their relation to other words.—Clark's Normal, p. 85.

It is that modification which distinguishes the relation of nouns and pronouns to other words.—Brown, p. 52, Burt, p. 75.

By the *Case* of a noun is meant the relation in which it stands to other words, and to the sentence.—Boltwood, p. 101.

It is that property of nouns and pronouns which shows how they are used in the construction of sentences.—Ker's Common School, p. 95.

The simple word and suffix are together called a case.—Swinton, p. 34.

It is the condition of a noun (i. e., relation to other words).—Clark's Begin., p. 74.

The case of a noun or pronoun depends upon its relation to other words.—Vickroy (1870), p. 69.

Case is *form*, not *relation*; nevertheless, the form is determined by the relation.—Vickroy, 2d Circle, p. 48 (1881).

Case denotes the relation of a noun or pronoun to other words.—Greene, p. 53; Wells, p. 47. (1865).

Case is relation, etc.—Wells, p. 42 (1880).

It is that property which distinguishes the relation of nouns and pronouns to other words in a sentence.—Quackenbos, p. 51.

It is a distinction based on the relation, etc.—Ker's Shorter Course, p. 85.

It signifies the relation which nouns have to other words.—Butler, p. 28.

It means the different state, situation, or position nouns have in relation to other words.—Kirkham, p. 41.

It denotes the relation which a noun sustains to other words in the sentence, expressed sometimes by its termination and sometimes by its position.—Fowler, p. 26.

Cases are forms of words used on account of the relations the words hold to other words.—Hinds' Topics, p. 43.

In some languages the form of nouns and pronouns determines their case. Not so in English. All nouns have the same forms. Clark's Begin. p. 76.

Case is a mode of inflection used to show the relation of a word to another word.—Colegrove, p. 84.

I deem the essential qualities of case in English to consist, not in the changes and inflections produced on nouns and pronouns, but in the offices which they perform in a sentence, by assuming different positions in regard to other words. In accordance with this definition these cases can be easily explained on reasoning principles founded in the nature of things.—Kirkham, p. 41.

Case [is] the form of substances in English, by which their relations to the other parts of the sentence are indicated.—Webster's Dictionary.

The use which is made of a noun or the office which a noun has in the construction of a sentence, is called the *case* of a noun.—Cruttenden, p. 157.

Case is a rhetorical attribute, which the noun derives from its use or office in the sentence.—Cruttenden, p. 200.

It is a change in the termination or situation of nouns.—Long, p. 12.

In the Latin, Greek, German and many other languages, the cases of nouns are determined by their terminations. But, as English nouns have no inflections, except to form adjuncts, the cases are determined only by the offices of nouns in sentences.—Clark's Normal, p. 85.

Case means little more than use in connection with other words. Abbott, How to Parse, p. 29.

The word case properly means ending, and was introduced into our language from a language in which different relations are indicated by different endings. There is no necessity for retaining it when speaking of nouns.

Those who use the name of case for the relations call the subject the nominative case; the object of a verb, or the subsequent of a preposition, the objective case; and a noun in the possessive relation, the possessive case, calling all other relations the independent case. But it is better to drop the term "case" in analyzing, and to speak of a noun as subject, object, subsequent, possessive, or as absolute, that is without *grammatical relation*.—Boltwood, p. 101.

Now, from the foregoing quotations, we see that there exists among our grammarians a very great diversity of opinion as to what case in English is. Some tell us that case is "*relation*;" some, that it is a "*property that denotes relation*;" some, a "*property that depends upon relation*;" some a "*modification indicated by relation*;" some, a "*modification which distinguishes relation*;" some, a distinction based upon relation;" some that it is "*state or condition*;" some that it is "*form*;" some that it is "*ending*;" some that it is the "*use or office-work*" of a noun or pronoun; some, that it is "*a rhetorical attribute*" which the noun derives from its "*use or office-work*;" some that it is "*position or situation*;" and some "*that there is no necessity of retaining it, because the English noun is without grammatical relation*!"

Says Mr. Kirkham: "I think that five grains of common sense will enable any one to comprehend what is meant by case. Its real character is extremely simple; but in the different grammars it assumes as many meanings as Proteus had shapes. The most that has been written on it, however, is mere verbiage. What, then is meant by case? . . . It is *position or situation*. This is clear."

Surely amid such a variety of viands, the grammatical epicure ought to be able to find something that will satisfy his palate!

Now, the foregoing different views, as well as several minor shades of opinion, are offered us by as many different authorities. If we adopt any one of them we shall be at variance with many of the others, while if we adopt the view of one particular authority—Mr. Boltwood—we shall throw case out of English grammar entirely. "When doctors differ," etc.

If we now examine some of these authors separately, we shall see how consistent each grammarian is with himself.

Harvey says: "Case is the *relation* of a noun or pronoun to other words." He also says, "The Absolute case is the use of a noun independent of any governing word."

Now, how can a noun that is used independently be said to sustain any grammatical relation to any other word? Or, if it possesses any relation, must it not be an independent relation? And what kind of a relation is an *independent* relation? What kind of a dependence is an independent dependence? Again, if case is the relation of a noun to some other word, would it not follow that a noun which has no such relation can have no case? And why does it not follow that Mr. Harvey's "Absolute" case is, according to his own definition, *no case at all*? It seems to us rather a *difficult* case! Moreover, on pp. 32 and 108, he gives us the "Objective case without a governing word."

Now the noun in each of these conditions—"absolute" and "objective"—is employed only to name objects, and in each instance, is used "without a governing word." What then, in these instances, is the radical difference between Mr. Harvey's "objective" and his "absolute" case? Both are without government, and, therefore, independent. We might present our argument thus:

It takes *relation* to make case.

Nouns independent of government have no relation.

Ergo, Nouns independent of government have no case.