

very different map from what we have now. The whole city of Vancouver is by commercial interests attached to British Columbia. No one suggests boundary lines should not be drawn across that area. The whole population of Ontario is attached commercially to Toronto, but no one suggests that the area of Toronto should be so enlarged. It has never been considered that the drawing of political lines across a territory detaches it commercially from the cities at the centre of that area. Railways will run across it, roads will run through it, and a person never thinks of political lines when he goes to do business. I say again that any map which could be drawn of any province could be criticized, but when you apply all considerations to the present map of the province of Saskatchewan, including Battlefords and Prince Albert, you have about as fair a map as could be drawn of that province.

Mr. MOTHERWELL: I wonder if I may ask the hon. member for Regina if he can see any objection to making the change.

Mr. TURNBULL: Which change?

Mr. MOTHERWELL: We have used all our ability to show the advantages of this change, and I believe the government representatives have not shown any disadvantage. True enough, the Prime Minister urged the advantages of provincial boundaries being followed, but I hasten to assure him—and I think he knows it—that out west we do not follow municipal or provincial lines. We never think of them at all. Federal boundaries are quite distinct. The federal boundaries of the two Battlefords have been entirely distinct. They have been distinct entities ever since they were established. They never were together federally. I know the story of them very well. It is true that at one time there was one Battleford, but as soon as there were two they were kept separate and distinct; they were not merged. Now, after many years, after this policy was established in 1914 by Sir Robert Borden's government, and later confirmed by a Liberal government in the Redistribution Act of 1924, this new merger is made. Both previous redistributions to which I have referred agreed on the southern boundary being the Saskatchewan river, and at this time we are asking only that the same principle be observed, and that the same southern boundary if possible be preserved. Sometimes boundaries have to be disturbed, but in the present instance the point is that for the want of moving the east boundary line a mere matter of six miles, the two Battlefords, both the town and the city, are being put into one constituency. By leaving North Battleford in

[Mr. Turnbull.]

the territory with which it has natural communications, its proper position will be preserved. I have not heard any argument to refute that statement.

Mr. BENNETT: The difficulty in this case is the difficulty which has arisen in all these cases. I have never envied the position of the hon. member for Humboldt (Mr. Totzke) in the committee. Had he not insisted upon putting forward an entire plan of redistribution, and had he contented himself with dealing with the situation unit by unit I think we might have been able to arrive at some more—shall I say—mutually satisfactory arrangement. Conceding that an adjustment is necessary—and that is conceded by all—it involves a change of boundaries. The question as to how those boundaries can best be changed without doing violence to existing conditions to an extent which would be unfair has been the very earnest effort, at least, of hon. members of the committee, who represented the government. It is unfortunate, but by reason of one constituency being maintained without any changes in its boundaries, it has had its repercussions throughout the entire province. The creation of the new constituency at Rosthern, as I pointed out a few moments ago, necessitated changes being made in the boundaries not only of constituencies nearby but also in constituencies that were overpopulated in order that the unit of population might be fairly observed.

At this time in the afternoon I shall not trespass upon the time of the committee to do more than to say this, that it was apparent that changes had to be made in the boundaries of Prince Albert; it was apparent that changes had to be made in the boundaries of the Battlefords; it was apparent that changes had to be made in the boundaries of Melfort, and it was apparent, also, that a new constituency had to be built by reason of the circumstances to which I have alluded, namely, population conditions. A new constituency was built up, and I have endeavoured to explain to this committee as fairly as I could the real, earnest desire to meet the views of the right hon. leader of the opposition and I think—I may be wrong in this—that what he said a moment ago is true, namely, that in dealing with figures it is always difficult, when you have polls which are split by reason of three-cornered contests, to determine exactly what the vote has been. Where there are three candidates it is almost impossible.