

Churchill and come back to Norway House. I cannot say definitely whether he went by Hayes river or Nelson river. He could go either way. The result in time would be much the same, but it is generally considered that the Hayes river route is the better one. He did not go by the round-about route that my hon. friend suggests.

Mr. CAMPBELL. My information is that he did actually take the route which I suggest, that he only touched at Norway House on his way back, that he went from Berens river to Island lake, then to God's lake, to Cross lake, to Split lake, thence to York Factory and naturally on to Churchill. The minister is asking us to pass a certain vote and he tells us the reason why he asks that. A statement which I make, on what I believe is good authority, the minister says is absolutely wrong. If the minister is absolutely wrong and I happen to be right, what reason has this committee to judge that the minister is right? I take the same stand as my hon. friend from Halton (Mr. Henderson) does, that when a man is paid to work for 365 days in the year, or when he is paid a salary, not as a crossing sweeper as compared with other higher occupations referred to by the minister, he should not be paid for a greater length of time. This man Semmens is paid by the Indian Department for doing all the work that the department requires with regard to Indians. This is only part of his work, and why he should be paid for 444 days while employees in the buildings attached to this House working in the same service can only be paid for 365 days is something beyond my comprehension, and I therefore move that this item, No. 370, amounting to \$395, be struck out.

Mr. MIDDLEBRO. Has the minister the information as to the cost of this expedition?

Mr. OLIVER. The total cost of the trip, including the work of inspection and treaty payment on the way, was \$4,000. In regard to the route followed, I find I was in error, and that Mr. Semmens, on his way out, went by way of Berens river, Deer lake, Island lake, Oxford House, God's lake, Nelson House and Split lake—

Mr. CAMPBELL. Just as I said.

Mr. OLIVER. Yes, that is correct—then further to York Factory and Churchill. The whole trip occupied 106 days, but we deduct from the 106 days 27 days which was the time occupied in the actual inspection work, and we charged for the additional 79 days which were occupied outside of the ordinary inspection work.

Item voted: Yeas 40, nays 30.

To provide an amount to pay Dr. J. D. Lafferty for special services and expenses

rendered in visiting the Blood and Peigan Indian boarding schools, \$174.

Mr. SCHAFFNER. What is Dr. Lafferty's salary, and what are his duties?

Mr. OLIVER. His salary is \$1,800. His duties are medical attendance on the Black Foot reserve, Stoney reserve, Sarcee reserve and Indian school at High river.

Mr. HERRON. I cannot understand why Dr. Lafferty who lives in Calgary quite a distance from the reserve should be employed. There must be competent physicians in the vicinity of the reserve, whose travelling expenses would be less than half and who would be nearer to the Indians in case of illness. What is the explanation?

Mr. OLIVER. There are two sides to this as to every question. The question is: Shall we pay a man of high standing in his profession a salary for giving a portion of his time or shall we pay a man of less high standing for giving the whole of his time. My own impression is that when it comes to medical advice the best is the cheapest, and the higher salary a man can command the better his services are. In my humble judgment it is more in the interest of the Indians that when medical advice is required by them they should have it from a man of the high standing of Dr. Lafferty rather than from a man of less high standing in the medical profession. Possibly the view of my hon. friend is the better one, but the other is the view I would take in the matter of personal concern, and it is a fair proposition that I should apply the same rule to the Indians.

Mr. ROCHE. Is Dr. Lafferty engaged in private practice in the city of Calgary?

Mr. OLIVER. Of course we could not secure the whole of Dr. Lafferty's services for \$1,800 a year.

Mr. ROCHE. Is it not the fact that on the two reserves there is a medical man besides Dr. Lafferty? Does not Dr. O. C. Edwards get a salary of \$1,850 a year for attending to these two reserves? Was Dr. Lafferty paid for attending the reserves during the absence of Dr. Edwards?

Mr. OLIVER. Dr. Edwards is in charge of these reserves but this expense was incurred in connection with a special investigation into tuberculosis upon the Indian reserves, and in the Indian schools, which was carried on by Dr. Bryce of the department at Ottawa and Dr. Lafferty. These two gentlemen are considered to be specially eminent in that branch of their profession and it was thought wise to engage them as a sort of commission to inquire into tuberculosis among the Indians. Their report is published and this vote is to pay Dr. Lafferty for the special work he did in that matter.