

Mr. NEILL: If refuting a misstatement is not a question of privilege, then I appeal from your decision, Mr. Speaker.

Mr. SPEAKER: It is not a question of privilege and it is not a proper statement to make.

Mr. NEILL: Then I appeal from your decision. I have not even been allowed to state the question. Am I permitted to continue?

Mr. SPEAKER: The hon. member can appeal from the Speaker's ruling if he wishes. I rule that it is not a question of privilege, and it is an attempt on the part of the hon. member now to continue a debate which, so far as he is concerned, is closed.

Mr. NEILL: Then I appeal from that decision. While you are looking up the points of order, perhaps I may be allowed to state the question.

Mr. SPEAKER: I am looking up the procedure in regard to appealing from a Speaker's ruling. The hon. member for Comox-Alberni having quoted from the speech of the hon. member for Fraser Valley, as reported in Hansard of April 22, 1932, at page 2295, and on a question of privilege undertaking to reply thereto; the Speaker having ruled that the same is not a question of privilege and that the hon. member for Comox-Alberni is out of order, the hon. member for Comox-Alberni appeals from that ruling.

The house divided on the question: Shall the ruling of the chair be sustained? And the ruling was sustained on the following division:

YEAS

Messrs:

| | |
|--------------------------------------|----------------------|
| Arthurs, | Gordon, |
| Barber, | Hay, |
| Beaubier, | Johnstone, |
| Belec, | Loucks, |
| Bennett, | Macdonald (Kings), |
| Bourgeois, | Macdougall, |
| Boyes, | MacLaren, |
| Burns, | MacNicol, |
| Bury, | Manion, |
| Cahan, | Morand, |
| Chaplin, | Mullins, |
| Charters, | Murphy, |
| Cotnam, | Myers, |
| Cowan (Port Arthur- Thunder Bay), | Perley (Qu'Appelle), |
| Davies, | Pettit, |
| Cowan (Long Lake), | Pickel, |
| Dickie, | Plunkett, |
| Embury, | Price, |
| Esling, | Quinn, |
| Gagnon, | Rogers, |
| Garland (Carleton), | Ryckman, |
| | Senn, |

| | |
|----------------------|-----------------------|
| Shaver, | Stewart (Lethbridge), |
| Simpson | Stirling, |
| (Simcoe North), | Sutherland, |
| Smith | Swanston, |
| (Victoria-Carleton), | Thompson |
| Smoke, | (Simcoe East), |
| Spankie, | Thompson (Lanark), |
| Sproule, | Turnbull, |
| Stanley, | White (London), |
| Stevens, | White (Mount Royal), |
| Stewart (Leeds), | Wright.—62. |

NAYS

Messrs:

| | |
|----------------------|------------------|
| Ahearn, | Hurtubise, |
| Blair, | Isley, |
| Bothwell, | King, Mackenzie, |
| Bouchard, | MacInnis, |
| Butcher, | Macphail (Miss), |
| Cayley, | McPhee, |
| Chevrier, | Mitchell, |
| Denis, | Munn, |
| Donnelly, | Neill, |
| Euler, | Parent, |
| Fiset, Sir Eugène, | Reid, |
| Fournier, | St-Père, |
| Gardiner, | Sanderson, |
| Garland (Bow River), | Speakman, |
| Gershaw, | Stewart |
| Goulet, | (Edmonton West), |
| Heaps, | Totzke, |
| Howden, | Woodsworth.—35. |

PAIRS

(The list of pairs is furnished by the chief whips.)

Messrs:

| | |
|-------------------------|----------------------------------|
| Anderson (Halton), | Factor, |
| Anderson (High-Park), | Boucher, |
| Arsenault, | Thauvette, |
| Baker, | Bertrand, |
| Baribeau, | Dumaine, |
| Barrette, | Rhéaume, |
| Bell (Hamilton West), | Mercier (St. Henri), |
| Bell (St. Antoine), | Raymond, |
| Bell (St. John-Albert), | Dubois, |
| Beynon, | Coote, |
| Black (Halifax), | Dubuc, |
| Bowen, | McKenzie, |
| Bowman, | Hanson (Skeena), |
| Cantley, | Cardin, |
| Casselman, | Howard, |
| Dorion, | Verville, |
| Duguay, | Bou langer, |
| Dupré, | Ferland, |
| Duranleau, | Hanbury, |
| Edwards, | Elliott, |
| Fraser (Cariboo), | McMillan (Huron), |
| Fortin, | Fafard, |
| Geary, | Mercier (Laurier- Outremont), |
| Gobeil, | Rinfret, |
| Gott, | Rutherford, |
| Guthrie, | Lapointe, |
| Hackett, | Perras, |
| Hanson | Veniot, |
| (York-Sunbury), | |
| Harris, | Jacobs, |
| Kennedy (Winnipeg), | McIntosh, |
| Lafleche, | Girouard, |
| Laurin, | Fontaine, |
| Lawson, | Gray, |
| Lennox, | Pouliot, |