

by the remarks Mr. Shaw has quoted—that we were set up to consider appropriate legislation. I am simply asking Mr. MacDonald whether the draft bill before us now is the same as the appropriate legislation previously presented by him?

Mr. THATCHER: Just on a point of order and I think this is a fair question. Every retailer, wholesaler, and manufacturer, is interested in knowing what the government's intentions are as far as the actual legislation is concerned. They are going to want to come down here and make representations. If they know what the government originally intended I think they can make saner representations than they might otherwise do. The fact that you say this is what the government intended is not going to tie you in any way but it will let us know what the government proposes?

Mr. BEAUDRY: Mr. Chairman, I would submit this, and I hope that Mr. Fulton will not consider it too is stupid. The commissioner of Combines has no authority to speak for the government.

Mr. FULTON: No one is asking him to do that.

Mr. CROLL: On a point of order, there was a motion or an amendment a minute ago that was defeated by this committee—dealing with the same point raised now by Mr. Thatcher and Mr. Fulton. The amendment was defeated and it was decided that we would proceed in this way.

The CHAIRMAN: Every member here, as a member of the House of Commons or of the Senate, has seen many examples where the minister has rightly refused to produce an inter-departmental communication from his staff to himself.

Mr. THATCHER: But also on a point of order, when we start to ask questions of the witness are we going to have back bench government members make the answers—

The CHAIRMAN: If that is your attitude you will find that you are also a back bench member.

Mr. THATCHER: I am an opposition member.

The CHAIRMAN: Every member of this committee, whether a senator or a member of parliament and of whatever party has equal rights as a member of this committee.

Mr. THATCHER: If we have equal rights, when we ask questions why cannot we have them answered by the witness.

The CHAIRMAN: You can ask questions of the witness and have them answered if they are in order, but I rule that a question of the kind you asked is out of order.

Mr. FULTON: I move that we ask the Minister of Justice to attend immediately and I will put the question to him?

The CHAIRMAN: I think you are also aware that in such a committee as this it is not proper to ask one of our own members to attend. Mr. Garson is a member but he is out of town today. He will be present in future.

Mr. FULTON: Well, I will not press that but I give notice that I wish to ask the minister that question which you have ruled out of order as a question to Mr. MacDonald?

The CHAIRMAN: To the minister the question is perfectly in order but it is out of order to ask it of Mr. MacDonald.

The WITNESS: As I said, this draft that the members of the committee now have before them represents what I believe to be the recommendations of the MacQuarrie committee in legislative form. I have brought them at your request.