

obscurity he may have labored under through the careless report in *Ent. Am.* will, I hope, be hereby dissipated.

Proof of the carnivorous habit is what I was aiming at, and it is one thing to presume a probable fact; it is another thing to establish it. The presumptive fact had been recorded here for four years, but the positive fact was only obtained by Mr. Pergande at the time stated by me.

Again, in another place (*loc. cit.* p. 152, paragraph 4) Mr. Edwards's language would indicate, to one not familiar with my article, that I had said something to the effect that no other butterfly had, or could have, a carnivorous larva. He makes me say in fact that "this is the only butterfly known whose larva is carnivorous"; whereas my language was, "so far as I can find, there is not another recorded carnivorous butterfly larva." No one could justly use his language who was not familiar with the larva of every butterfly known; whereas my remark simply emphasizes mine as the first record of such a carnivorous butterfly larva and leaves the implication that others may be found.

I was much interested in the experience of Mr. Edwards and Miss Morton, not only because it confirms the carnivorous habit of the species announced in my paper, but because it adds so many interesting observations which tend to prove the carnivorous habit normal and not exceptional.

Mr. Edwards has asked me to publish the facts we have recorded here in the C. E.

Mr. Pergande's notes were merely chronological and colorational, connected with the preserved egg-shells and about 30 larvæ of all sizes. I did not use them last spring because I had not time to go over the material and draw up full descriptions that should combine structure as well as coloration. Ill health has since prevented, and with Mr. Edwards's very full descriptions there is no longer the necessity. In brief I may state, however, that Mr. Pergande's notes show that:

July 8, 1880, the larvæ were found in the leaf curls of *Pemphigus (fraxinifolii)* on Ash, and that the larvæ died without feeding on the leaves that were placed with them.

In 1881 search was again made for the larvæ on the same tree without finding any.

Aug. 23rd, 1882, three larvæ were found on a twig of Witch Hazel;