

BOYD, C.]

[Dec. 22.]

SCOTT ET AL v. SCOTT.

Life insurance—Benevolent society—Endorsement on policy—Devise by will inconsistent with endorsement—Who entitled—Trustee—Executors—R.S.O., c. 136, s. 5.

J.H.S. took out a policy of life insurance with the Order of Foresters, a benevolent society, conditioned to be paid "To the widow or orphans or personal representatives of the said brother (J.H.S.)," and endorsed and signed on it, "I hereby direct that the endowment benefit due at my death on this endowment certificate shall be paid to my daughter, L.A.S." Subsequently, by his will, he devised to his executors all the rest of his estate, "Including the proceeds of a life insurance policy in the Independent Order of Foresters for the sum of \$3,000," on certain trusts. After his death the proceeds of the policy were claimed by his executors and by his widow, who had been appointed guardian to the infant daughter, L.A.S.

Held, that the policy was within the meaning of R.S.O., c. 136, s. 5. That the effect of the endorsement was to withdraw the money from the control of the insured, so that upon his death it did not "form part of his estate." That such money was, however, payable "under the policy," and he could appoint trustees to receive and invest it where the person entitled was an infant, and that such trustee should be distinguished from his executors.

Held, also, that as the testator had directed his executors to hold this and other moneys in trust with directions repugnant to the absolute right of the daughter (L.A.S.), it would lead to confusion to let this money be mingled with other estate moneys in the hands of the executors, and that they were not competent trustees within the meaning of the Act (s. 11); and that as the widow had been duly appointed guardian for the infant daughter, and had given security for the due performance of her duties and the proper application of the money, she should be entrusted with it rather than the executors, and that the will was invalid so far as it assumed to deal with the policy.

D. M. Christie for the petitioners.

W. M. Douglas for the respondent.

BOYD, C.]

[Jan. 6.]

BEATTY v. DAVIS.

Gaming rights—Navigable water.

Ownership of land or water (though not enclosed) gives to the proprietor, under the common law, the sole and exclusive right to fish, fowl, hunt, or shoot, within the precincts of that private property, subject to the game laws when pertinent. And this exclusive right is not diminished by the fact that the land may be covered by navigable water. The right of navigation, when it exists, is to be used so as not to unnecessarily disturb or interfere with the enjoyment of the subordinate private rights of fishing and shooting. The public can only use the water for *bona fide* purposes of navigation, but not so as to occupy the water for the purposes of fishing or fowling when the soil underneath is the private property of one who objects to such occupation.

McCarthy, Q.C., and *H. S. Osler*, for the plaintiff.

Patterson, Q.C., for the defendant.

Practice.

Court of Appeal.]

[Jan. 13.]

MCNAIR v. BOYD.

Costs—Order of judge as to, under Rule 1172—"Good cause"—Allowing appeal without costs.

The words of Rule 1172, "The Judge or court makes no order respecting the costs," do not confer any wholly discretionary power on the Judge, but must be read with Rule 1170, as to an order made "for good cause."

And where, in an action in a County Court for damages for bodily injuries sustained by the plaintiff through the alleged negligence of the defendant, the jury found for the plaintiff and assessed the damages at \$30, and added that the defendant should pay "the Court expenses," and the Judge made an order that the defendant should have full County Court costs, and that the defendant should not have the set-off provided by Rule 1172, because, in his opinion, the injury done to the plaintiff was attended by circumstances of great aggravation, and the jury ought to have given larger damages,

Held, OSLER, J.A., dissenting, that these were not circumstances which constituted "good