

Point of Order—Mr. H. Gray

● (1510)

POINT OF ORDER**REQUEST FOR TABLING OF DOCUMENT REFERRED TO BY PRIME MINISTER**

Hon. Herb Gray (Windsor West): I rise on a point of order. During today's Question Period the Prime Minister (Mr. Mulroney) read verbatim from a document which he identified as coming from the Clerk of the Privy Council. Unless I am mistaken, he did not simply mention the existence of such a document, he quoted from it verbatim. Therefore, pursuant to the well established precedents in this regard, for example, Citation 327(6) on page 116 of *Beauchesne*, I ask, Mr. Speaker, that you direct the document in question be tabled. The citation in part states:

If a Minister cites or quotes an official document in debate, he should be prepared to table it.

If I am not mistaken, this precedent, and others in that regard, have been deemed to apply to documents quoted from during Question Period by Ministers, as well as those quoted from during debate.

My point of order is that because the Prime Minister appeared to quote verbatim from an official document, I call upon the Prime Minister to follow the precedents and table that document forthwith.

Hon. Don Mazankowski (Deputy Prime Minister and President of the Privy Council): I was going to say that, on the point of order of the House Leader of the Liberal Party, he was being carried away with his imagination. Then in his final sentence he qualified it. He said the Prime Minister (Mr. Mulroney) "appeared" to quote. That is precisely the point. The Prime Minister does have notes, and he makes notes as the questions are presented. I am not sure whether the Hon. Member is asking the Prime Minister to table his notes.

Mr. Speaker: Order, please. The Chair has listened very carefully to the comments of the Deputy Prime Minister (Mr. Mazankowski). I might indicate to the Hon. Member for Windsor West (Mr. Gray) that he has put the procedural law accurately. There seems to be some dispute. Ordinarily, I would not call for Members to rise over and over again on this matter, but I think it is appropriate to hear from the Hon. Member for Windsor West.

Mr. Gray (Windsor West): In view of what the Government House Leader (Mr. Mazankowski) has just said, I would ask, Mr. Speaker, before making your ruling in any final form that you consult the "blues" in their unrevised form, as well as consulting the official electronic record of this House both in its televised and radio form. We cannot let this matter go in the way that the Government House Leader has suggested. The record is an important basis for the decision that I respectfully ask you to make on this important matter.

Mr. Mazankowski: The Hon. House Leader for the Liberal Party by his statement is implying that there is meddling going

on in the transcript of *Hansard*. I think that he may wish to reconsider making that point. The Hon. Member has been around here for a long time. To imply that is certainly most unbecoming, and I am surprised at him.

Mr. Jean-Robert Gauthier (Ottawa—Vanier): I wish to rise because I think this is a very important point. From what I understood the Deputy Prime Minister (Mr. Mazankowski) to say to the House, he is denying that the document exists from which the Prime Minister (Mr. Mulroney) quoted. Is he denying that, yes or no? If he is denying it, then he has to make his case. I am saying that if there is a document, then he has to table it. That is the custom of the House.

Mr. Mazankowski: I thought I made it very clear that the Prime Minister uses notes, some of which he prepares here, and some of which he prepares in his office. That is what I suggested that he was quoting from if he was quoting.

The Hon. Member from time to time when he puts his questions quotes from a document. I suspect that if we establish that practice, we will be asking each and every Member to table the questions that they read into the record.

Mr. Russell MacLellan (Cape Breton—The Sydneys): I rise on the same point of order. The Prime Minister (Mr. Mulroney) in reading from the document, it appeared to me that the words did not come from notes but came from a document. I would ask that the Speaker satisfy himself that it was notes, or it was a document, and personally to review the documents to assure himself before he makes a decision on this matter.

Hon. Bob Kaplan (York Centre): I would like to add a word. At one point I clearly saw the Prime Minister (Mr. Mulroney) reading from a document that he said was a letter to me. I confirmed with my office that we have not received such a letter. If it was a letter sent by the Commissioner to me that is passing through the hands of the Prime Minister, I would like to ask that the letter be tabled.

Mr. Speaker: Order, please. The Hon. Deputy Prime Minister (Mr. Mazankowski) probably does not realize it, but because I was talking to another Member, I was unable to recognize him and his words of wisdom will be lost. We would not want that to happen.

Mr. Mazankowski: The Hon. Member who just rose on on a point of order clearly has a valid point of order. The Prime Minister (Mr. Mulroney) on that occasion was quoting from a letter.

Mr. Tobin: How could he get a letter hand delivered?

Mr. Mazankowski: I can't answer that.

Mr. Clark (Yellowhead): Nunziata stole it and delivered it.

Some Hon. Members: Withdraw!